

# COURSE DESIGN RUBRIC

The Online Education Initiative (OEI) is a collaborative effort among California Community Colleges (CCCs) to ensure that significantly more students are able to complete their educational goals by increasing both access to and success in **high quality online courses**.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Revisions approved by the Online Education Initiative Steering Committee December 9, 2016.



# **Online Course Review Information**

Faculty Name:				
Date:				
Duto:				
College:				
Local Course ID:				
Course C-ID:				
Review type:	Self	☐ <sub>P1</sub>	☐ P2	ACE
Reviewer Name:				
Information below	this line wi	II be comple	ted by the Lo	ead Reviewer
Lead Reviewer:				
				<b>_</b>
Aligned Sections:	☐ A	<b>Ц</b> в		<b>□</b> c
	D	□ ₽		

**The OEI Course Design Rubric** was developed in 2014 by the OEI Professional Development work group to assure that all courses offered as part of the initiative promote student success and meet existing regulatory and accreditation requirements. It has undergone three major revisions since then, including the current iteration, in response to changes in available instructional technology and feedback from both instructors and reviewers.

For a course to be offered to students in the CCC Course Exchange, it must first go through a course review process that ensures alignment with the OEI Course Design Rubric. The Rubric is divided into five sections.

### **Creative Commons Licensed Content**

In addition to preparing courses for the CCC Course Exchange, the OEI Course Design Rubric is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License and can be used as:

- A roadmap for instructors designing new online courses.
- A tool for instructors seeking to update or improve existing courses.
- The foundation for starting a local POCR (Peer Online Course Review) Club.

Visit <u>ccconlineed.org</u> for more information on the OEI, the Rubric, and the Course Review Process. We welcome your feedback and suggestions

### **SECTIONS A-C**

### **Section A: Content Presentation**

The 13 elements for quality course design in this section address how content is organized and accessed in the course management system. Key elements include course navigation, learning objectives, and access to student support information.

### **Section B: Interaction**

The 8 elements in this section address instructor initiated and student initiated communication. Key elements of quality course design covered in this section include regular effective contact, student-to-student collaboration, and communication activities that build a sense of community among online learners.

### Section C: Assessment

The 8 elements in this section address the variety and effectiveness of assessments within the course. Key elements include the alignment of objectives and assessments, the clarity of instructions for completing assessments, and evidence of timely and regular feedback.

Following a review by a team of trained faculty peer reviewers, each element in Sections A-C will be marked in one of three ways:

### Incomplete:

The element is missing or present to a degree that does not adequately support student success in online learning.

# Aligned:

The element is present and effectively designed to support student success in online learning.

# **Additional Exemplary Elements:**

This designation recognizes design choices that further enhance the student experience in the online learning environment.

### **Review Results**

If any element in Section A-C is Incomplete, the instructor will receive on-going support from a dedicated Course Design Specialist to bring the element(s) into alignment with the rubric.

### **SECTION D**

# **Accessibility**

The 23 elements in this section are reviewed to determine if a student using assistive technologies will be able to access course content as required by Section 508 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 (also known as "508 Compliance").

Since Section D addresses elements that are required by law to be present, the elements in this section can only be marked as **Incomplete or Aligned**.

### **Review Results**

If any element in Section D is Incomplete, the instructor will receive on-going support from a dedicated Course Design Specialist or an Accessibility Expert to bring the element(s) into alignment with the rubric.

### **SECTION E**

# **Institutional Accessibility Concerns**

The 4 elements in this section cover accessibility of external tools and third-party content. While the accessibility elements in Section D are primarily under the control of faculty when developing a course, the elements in Section E may be outside the purview of the instructor which would require additional consideration or intervention at the institutional level.

### **Review Results**

If a course is aligned in all Sections except E, the OEI Chief Professional Development Officer and the Director of Accessibility will look at the specific accessibility issue(s) and work with the instructor on a plan for making the course accessible.

# **Table of Sections**

Section A: Content Presentation	8
A1: Placement of Unit-level Objectives	8
A2: Clarity of Unit-level Objectives	8
A3: Alignment of Unit-level Objectives	8
A4: Course Navigation	9
A5: Unit-level Chunking	9
A6: Page-level Chunking	9
A7: Effective Use of CMS Tools	10
A8: Student Centered Teaching	10
A9: Instructions	10
A10: Individualized Learning	10
A11: Learner Feedback	11
A12: Institutional Policies	11
A13: Student Services	11
Section B: Interaction	12
B1: Pre-Course Contact	12
B2: Instructor Initiated Contact	12
B3: Technology Support	12
B4: Instructor Contact Info	12
B5: Student Initiated Interaction	13
B6: Student-to-Student Interaction	13
B7: Learning Community	13
B8: Participation Levels	13
Section C: Assessment	14
C1: Authenticity	14
C2: Validity	14
C3: Variety	14
C4: Frequency	14
C5: Rubrics/Scoring Guide	15
C6: Assessment Instructions	15
C7: Feedback	15
C8: Self-Assessment	

# **Table of Sections**

Section D: Accessibility – Content Pages	16
D1: Heading Styles	16
D2: Lists	16
D3: Links	16
D4: Tables	16
D5: Color Contrast	16
D6: Color and meaning	16
D7: Images	16
Section D: Accessibility – Files	18
D8: Heading Styles	18
D9: Lists	18
D10: Links	18
D11: Tables	18
D12: Color Contrast	18
D13: Color and meaning	18
D14: Images	18
D15: Digital Reading Order	19
D16: Digital Presentations	19
D17: PDFs	19
D18: Spreadsheets	19
Section D: Accessibility – Multimedia	21
D19: Audio and Video	21
D20: Live Broadcast	21
D21: Auto-Play	21
D22: Flashing Content	21
Section D: Accessibility – Accommodation	21
D23: Instructional Materials Inventory	21
Section E: Institutional Accessibility Concerns	23
E1: LTI/Apps	23
E2: Media Players	23
E3: Websites	23
E4: Dublisher Content	ာ

# **Section A: Content Presentation**

Incomplete	Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements
A1: Placement of Unit-level Ob	jectives	
Objectives are not included in individual learning units/modules.	Objectives are included in the individual learning units/modules.	Objectives are included in assessments.
A2: Clarity of Unit-level Object	ives	
Objectives do not include demonstrable learning outcomes.	Objectives include demonstrable learning outcomes.	Objectives are written in language that is student centered.
A3: Alignment of Unit-level Ob	jectives	
Unit content and activities are not aligned with unit objectives.	Unit content and activities are aligned with unit objectives.	The connection between the content/activities and the unit objectives are made explicitly clear to the students.
Onitonio A4 A0 O		
Criteria A1 – A3 Comments:		

# **Section A: Content Presentation**

Incomplete	Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements
A4: Course Navigation		
Navigation and content flow are not easily determined.	Navigation and content flow are easily determined by the user.	Clearly labeled tutorial materials that explain how to navigate the specific course are included.
A5: Unit-level Chunking		
Content is not presented in visibly distinct learning units or modules.	Content is presented in visibly distinct learning units or modules.	Learning units or modules are consistently structured and sequenced allowing students to better anticipate and manage their workload.
A6: Page-level Chunking		
Page content is not chunked in manageable segments using headings; long pages of text make online reading difficult.	Page content is chunked in manageable segments using headings that facilitate online reading.	Page content uses descriptive headings and subheadings that enhance student understanding of the material.
Criteria A4 – A6 Comments:		

# **Section A: Content Presentation**

	Incomplete		Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements	
A7: Ef	fective Use of CMS Tools	s			
	CMS tools that could reduce the labor intensity of learning are not used effectively.		Course Management System (CMS) tools are used to reduce the labor- intensity of learning in a way that streamlines access to materials and activities for students.		CMS Tools are used to provide integrated and innovative learning materials and activities for students.
A8: St	udent Centered Teaching	g			
	Content is presented using only one modality.		A variety of modalities, such as text, audio, video, images and/or graphics are used to create student-centered learning.		Technology is used creatively to emphasize student-centered learning throughout the course.
A9: Ins	structions				1
	Instructions for working with course content is incomplete, or non-existent.		Course design includes instructions for learners to work with content in meaningful ways (e.g. instructing students to take notes during a video, explaining the purpose of an external resource).		Instructions are directly embedded with the content or activity.
A10: lı	ndividualized Learning	<u> </u>			
	There are few or no individualized learning opportunities, such as remedial activities or resources for advanced learning.		Individualized learning opportunities, such as remedial activities or resources for advanced learning, are provided.		Numerous individualized learning opportunities are provided throughout the course.
Criteri	ia A7 – A10 Comments:				

	Incomplete	Aligned		Additional Exemplary Elements
A11:	Learner Feedback		<b>'</b>	
	Learners do not have an opportunity to give anonymous feedback to the instructor regarding course design and/or course content.	Learners have the opportunity to give anonymous feedback to the instructor regarding course design and/or course content after course completion.		There are opportunities to give anonymous feedback both during course delivery and after course completion.
A12:	Institutional Policies			
	Institutional policies relevant for learner success are not included or are difficult to find.	Institutional policies relevant for learner success (e.g., plagiarism, academic honesty, technical support, and DSPS) are included and easy to find.		Institutional policies are provided in units or activities where they are most relevant.
A13:	Student Services			
	Links to institutional services are not included, thus requiring students to exit the course management system to find links for support.	Links to institutional services, including the DSPS office and the library, are embedded in the course and clearly labeled.		Links to institutional services are provided in units or activities when they may be needed mos
Crite	ria A11 – A13 Comments:			

# **Section B: Interaction**

Incomplete	Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements
B1: Pre-Course Contact		
Instructor does not initiate contact prior to or at the beginning of the course.	Instructor initiates contact prior to or at the beginning of course.	Instructor provides multiple resources to help students successfully start the course.
<b>B2: Instructor Initiated Contact</b>	i	
The plan for communication is unclear or missing.	The instructor provides students with his/her plan to engage in regular effective contact using CMS communication tools that includes expected time frames for responses to inquiries, discussion board posts, and feedback on assignments and assessments.	The instructor's plan to engage in regular effective contact includes the use of a wide variety of communication tools.
B3: Technology Support	The state of the mode for	
The instructor's role for supporting course technology is not explained to the students.	The instructor's role for supporting course technology is explained to students, and links to technology support are provided.	Links to technology support are provided where needed throughout the course.
B4: Instructor Contact Info		
Contact information for the instructor is missing or not easy to find.	Contact information for the instructor is easy to find and includes expected response times.	Students can choose from a variety of tools to contact the instructor.
Criteria B1 – B4 Comments:		

# **Section B: Interaction**

Incomplete	Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements
<b>B5: Student Initiated Interaction</b>	n	
Students are not given opportunities to initiate interaction.	Opportunities for student- initiated interaction with other students and the instructor are clearly available and encouraged.	Student-initiated interaction contributes to a student-centered learning environment.
B6: Student-to-Student Interact	tion	
Student-to-student interaction may be present but is not a required part of the course.	Student-to-student interaction that reinforces course content and learning outcomes is required as part of the course.	Student-to-Student collaboration is designed to build workplace skills such as teamwork, cooperation, negotiation, and consensus-building.
B7: Learning Community		
Communication activities that help build a sense of community among learners are not included.	The course includes communication activities that are designed to build a sense of community among learners.	The design and facilitation of communication activities are responsive to the variety of cultures and communication styles in the learning community.
B8: Participation Levels		_
Guidelines explaining required levels of student participation are not provided.	Guidelines explaining required levels of student participation (i.e., quantity and quality of interactions) are provided.	A rubric or equivalent grading document is included to explain how participation will be evaluated.
Criteria B5 – B8 Comments:		

# **Section C: Assessment**

	Incomplete	Aligned	Additional
04 - 4	•	<u> </u>	Exemplary Elements
C1: A	uthenticity		A a a a a a m a m ta a m a
	There is little or no evidence of authenticity built into assessments.	Assessment activities lead to the demonstration of learning outcomes.	Assessments are designed to mimic authentic environments to facilitate transfer.
C2: V	alidity		
	Students are evaluated on performance unrelated to the stated objectives.	Assessments appear to align with the objectives.	Assessments match the objectives and learners are directed to the appropriate objective(s) for each assessment.
C3: Va	ariety		
	Assessment types are limited to only one type of assessment (either formative or summative).	Both formative and summative assessments are used.	Multiple types of formative and summative assessments are used (research project, objective test, discussions, etc.).
C4: Fr	requency	 	
	Assessments are few and infrequent.	Multiple assessments are administered during the duration of the course.	Frequent assessments occur at regular intervals throughout the course, providing students with timely feedback on learning and performance.
Criter	ia C1 – C4 Comments:		

# **Section C: Assessment**

	1	
Incomplete	Aligned	Additional Exemplary Elements
C5: Rubrics/Scoring Guide  Rubrics or descriptive criteria for desired outcomes may not be included for some assessment activities.	Rubrics or descriptive criteria for desired outcomes are included.	Rubrics and/or descriptive criteria for desired outcomes include models of "good work."
C6: Assessment Instructions		
Assessments include little or no instruction.	Instructions clearly explain to students how to successfully complete the assessments.	Instructions are written clearly and with exemplary detail to ensure understanding.
C7: Feedback		
There is little to no evidence of meaningful feedback on student assessments.	The course includes a clear plan for providing meaningful, timely feedback on assessments.	Students are given clear instructions on accessing feedback in the CMS and guidance on applying feedback to improve learning and performance.
C8: Self-Assessment		
There is little to no evidence that students are provided opportunities for self-assessment	Opportunities for student self-assessment with feedback are present.	There are multiple opportunities for student self-assessment that encourage students to seek timely additional help.
Criteria C5 – C8 Comments:		
Official Co.		and the second s

# Section D: Accessibility – Content Pages

	Incomplete	Aligned	N/A
D1: F	leading Styles		
	Content Pages do not use heading styles or use them inconsistently, including skipping heading levels, and/or altered fonts/size/format/color are used instead of heading styles.	Content Pages consistently use heading styles (i.e. Heading 2, Heading 3, etc.).	
D2: L	ists		
	Numbers, letters, or symbols are manually inserted to create a list.	Lists are created using the Bullet or Numbered List tool in the rich text editor.	
D3: L	inks		
	Links are not descriptive, or URLs are displayed instead of meaningful links; and/or underlining is used for emphasis or for denoting headings.	Links are descriptive, and avoid redundancy; links avoid using non-descriptive phrases; and underlining is only used to denote active hyperlinks.	
D4: T	ables		
	Tables do not use designated header cells.	Table cells designated as row and/or column headers allow screen readers to read table cells in the correct order.	
D5: 0	Color Contrast		
	Insufficient color contrast between foreground (text or graphics) and the background could create difficulties for low vision and color blind students.	There is sufficient color contrast between foreground and background to meet Section 508 standards.	
D6: 0	Color and meaning		
	Visual elements alone have been used to convey meaning.	Visual elements (color, bolding, all caps) are not used as the sole way to convey importance or meaning.	
D7: I	mages		
	Does not consistently use descriptive alternative text, or the image has text that is not part of the alternative description, or uses "image of" or "picture of" as part of the alt text.	Every image (including those used in Pages, Discussions, Quizzes and Assignments) uses descriptive alternative text that includes any text visible in the image, does not contain "image of" or "picture of", and uses "" if the image is purely decorative.	

Criteria D1 – D7 comments on following page.

Content Pages (Criteria D1 – D7) Comments:				

# Section D: Accessibility - Files

	Incomplete		Aligned	N/A
D8: F	leading Styles			
	Documents do not use heading styles or use them inconsistently, including skipping heading levels, and/or altered fonts/size/format/color are used instead of heading styles.		Documents consistently use heading styles (i.e. Heading 2, Heading 3, etc.).	
D9: L	ists			
	Numbers, letters, or symbols are manually inserted to create a list.		Lists are created using the Bullet or Numbered List tool.	
D10:	Links			
	Links are not descriptive, or URLs are displayed instead of meaningful links; and/or underlining is used for emphasis or for denoting headings.		Links are descriptive, and avoid redundancy; links avoid using non-descriptive phrases; and underlining is only used to denote active hyperlinks.	
D11:	Tables			
	Tables do not use designated header cells.		Table cells designated as row and/or column headers allow screen readers to read table cells in the correct order.	
D12:	Color Contrast			
	Insufficient color contrast between foreground (text or graphics) and the background could create difficulties for low vision and color blind students.		There is sufficient color contrast between foreground and background to meet Section 508 standards.	
D13:	Color and meaning			
	Visual elements alone have been used to convey meaning.		Visual elements (color, bolding, all caps) are not used as the sole way to convey importance or meaning.	
D14:	D14: Images			
	Does not consistently use descriptive alternative text, or the image has text that is not part of the alternative description, or uses "image of" or "picture of" as part of the alt text.		Every image uses descriptive alternative text that includes any text visible in the image, doesn't contain "image of" or "picture of", and uses "" if the image is purely decorative.	

Section D: Accessibility – Files criteria continued on following page.

# Section D: Accessibility – Files continued

	Incomplete		Aligned	N/A
D15:	Digital Reading Order			
	Reading order is not correctly set so that content is presented in the proper sequence to screen readers and other assistive technologies.		Reading order is correctly set so that content is presented in the proper sequence to screen readers and other assistive technologies.	
D16:	Digital Presentations			
	Some slides have identical titles, reading order is not properly set (slides have had elements added to the layout), and/or images/charts do not include alternative text. Some text visible in slides is not visible in Outline View.		Every slide has a unique title, reading order is properly set (slides use pre-set layouts), and all images/charts include alternative text. All text is visible in Outline View so that it can be read by assistive technology.	
D17:	D17: PDFs			
	PDFs contain accessibility issues and do not pass the Adobe Accessibility Check.		PDFs pass the Adobe Accessibility Check with no substantial errors.	
D18:	Spreadsheets			
	Spreadsheets lack labels and supplemental explanations that would allow a student with visual or motor impairment to make use of the content using assistive technologies.		Spreadsheets include labels for the rows and columns, detailed labels for any charts, and is accompanied by a textual description of the spreadsheet, drawing attention to key cells, trends, and totals.	

Criteria D8 – D18 comments on following page.

Files (Oritaria DO DAO) Occurrente						
Files (Criteria D8 – D18) Comments:	Files (Criteria D8 – D18) Comments:					

# Section D: Accessibility – Multimedia

	Incomplete	Aligned		N/A
D19:	Audio and Video			
	Accurate transcripts are not included for audio and/or closed captioning for video is not present.		Accurate transcripts are included for audio, closed captioning for video, and narrative descriptions are available when possible.	
D20: Live Broadcast				
	Live broadcasts do not have synchronized captions.		Live broadcasts include a means for displaying synchronized captions.	
D21: Auto-Play				
	Multimedia is set to auto-play.		Multimedia is not set to auto-play.	
D22: Flashing Content				
	Contains blinking or strobing multimedia.		Multimedia (including gifs and images) do not blink or strobe.	

# **Section D: Accessibility – Accommodation**

	Incomplete		Aligned	N/A
D23:	Instructional Materials Inven	tory		
	Inherently inaccessible learning objects are present, and an instructional material inventory and plan for accommodation has not been provided.		An Instructional Material Inventory of each inherently inaccessible learning object is provided with a plan that has been reviewed and approved by the DSPS office for accommodating students with disabilities.	

Instructional material inventory form available at: <a href="http://bit.ly/material-inventory">http://bit.ly/material-inventory</a>

Criteria D19 – D23 comments on following page.

Multimedia (Criteria D19 – D22) & Accommodation (D23) Comments:				

# **Section E: Institutional Accessibility Concerns**

Incomplete*	Aligned	N/A
E1: LTI/Apps		
LTI or Apps used in the course have not been verified as accessible.	Any LTI or Apps used in the course have been verified as accessible.	
E2: Media Players		
Third-party media players used in the course have not been verified as accessible.	Any third-party media players used in the course have been verified as accessible.	
E3: Websites		
Third-party websites used in the course have not been verified as accessible.	Any third-party websites used in the course have been verified as accessible.	
E4: Publisher Content		
Publisher content used in the course has not been verified as accessible.	Any publisher content used in the course has been verified as accessible.	
*A determination of incomplete may result in an addi	itional level of review for OEI Exchange courses.	
Criteria E1 – E4 Comments:		





© 2016 Chancellor's Office, California Community Colleges

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

It is available to everyone and may be repurposed to meet the unique needs of educational institutions.

For more information about Creative Commons licenses visit <a href="https://creativecommons.org/licenses">https://creativecommons.org/licenses</a>.